CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JUNE 24, 2010 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR

SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Absent
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present

Boardmember Maria Curry Present arrived at 1:10PM

BoardmemberGail GarbiniPresentBoardmemberAnn JarmuschAbsentBoardmemberLinda MarronePresent

Boardmember Abel Silvas Present arrived at 1:20PM

Boardmember Ann Woods Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner

Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner Kiley Wallace, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR April 22, 2010 and May 27, 2010

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER GARBINI TO APPROVE THE APRIL 22, 2010 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 4-0-2 Motion Passes

(Aréchiga and Bethke)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER GARBINI TO APPROVE THE MAY 27, 2010, MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Vice-Chair Aréchiga Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Ione Stiegler announced the Grand Reopening of the Sikes Adobe Farmhouse in San Pasqual

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

Boardmembers Berge and Jarmusch notified Staff that they cannot attend today's meeting due to medical and dental issues.

OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Request for continuance for Item 6 1010 Leroy Street from the owner
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Introduce Intern Kiley Wallace, working with historical resources staff on several projects. Two additional Interns that will also be with us for the next few months. They should be with us at the HRB meeting next month.
- The Mayor has appointed Dr. Mike Baksh as our new Boardmember filling the required archaeologist position. City Council confirmation is scheduled for next Tuesday, June 29th. This appointment will fill the only vacancy on the Board. It is expected that Dr. Baksh will attend next month's meeting.
- Historic Planning staff hosted an open house for the Greater Golden Hill historic survey earlier this week. There was a good turn out and lots of good questions and exchange of information. We are looking forward to meeting with North Park and Uptown next week on Monday and Wednesday, respectively. These meetings constitute an important part our public outreach portion of the surveys. We are asking the public to discuss with us the historic themes that are important to the development of their community, the people and events that shaped the history of the community, and the historically significant individual properties and districts in the community. Announcements are provided on side table and on our website.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for July 7, 2010. The next Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, July 12, 2010.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of June 24, 2010 Page 3 of 7

• Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services and 3 individual homeowner nominations. There are 31 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 11 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The homeowner for Item 6 - 1010 Leroy Street is requesting a 30-day continuance

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT THE OWNERS REQUEST FOR A CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 6 – 1010 LEROY STREET AND FOR THE ITEM TO BE HEARD BY NOVEMBER OF 2010 WITH THE POSSIBILITY OF BEING HEARD IN OCTOBER IF THE SCHEDULE SHOULD PERMIT.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Aréchiga Vote: 7-0-1 Motion Passes

(Silvas)

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 - WINSLOW R. PARSONS SPEC HOUSE #1 located at 3520 28th Street

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Aréchiga Vote: 8-0-0 Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEM

ITEM A – SAN YSIDRO SURVEY

Staff will present a brief status update on the San Ysidro Historic Survey being prepared in support of the community plan update. This survey effort is being funded in part with a Certified Local Government grant.

No action on the part of the Board is required

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 - HENRY L. HIER SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Lancaster Family Revocable Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 1288 Silverado Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1288 Silverado Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Henry L. Hier Spec House #1 located at 1288 Silverado Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the garage, site wall and rear deck.

Report Number: HRB-10-028

Historical Resources Board Minutes of June 24, 2010 Page 4 of 7

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ione Stiegler (Michael Lancaster, Brandy Dewhurst)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Woods was persuaded by consultant and staff written reports.

Boardmember Silvas wanted to know if the owner(s) knew of the possibility of it being a historical building.

Boardmember Marrone is inclined to support the written consultant report and Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo finds the change in the consultant's recommendation to be very troubling; he has issues with the integrity of the site.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry sees a possible problem with the stucco wall and issues with visibility; she supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke is also concerned with the contradiction presented by consultant; wanted to know consultants position. Wall expresses a false sense of history that cannot be ignored; other modifications are acceptable.

Boardmember Garbini also supports Staff's recommendation; wall can be addressed under the Mills Act. She does not see any issues with the integrity.

Boardmember Silvas questioned that there wasn't much of a discussion on alterations.

Chair Lemmo may want more information and detail from the owner.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – HENRY L. HIER SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Aréchiga Vote: 8-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – 1010 LEROY STREET

Applicant: Anderson-Morton Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1010 Leroy Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 2-B)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1010 Leroy Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the house at 1010 Leroy Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-10-025

ITEM CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER

Historical Resources Board Minutes of June 24, 2010 Page 5 of 7

ITEM 7 – ALBERT EUGENE AND HELEN RILEY HOUSE

Applicant: Andrew Nelson Trust & Michael Koonce Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 5141 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 2-G)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 5141 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Albert Eugene and Helen Riley House, a 1926 model home that represented a special element of the Kensington Heights Subdivision in the Kensington-Talmadge Community as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A. The garage constructed in 1952 is excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-10-026

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron May (*Dale May*), Michael Koonce

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Garbini feels this house is significant to the neighborhood, agrees there has been lots of changes. She supports designation.

Boardmember Bethke questions it significance as an early home and catalyst to the development of neighborhood.

Boardmember Curry supports designation, as first in neighborhood it is a special element. Historic integrity is different from unity of style. Addition is part of the history of the building and would like to consider designating under "C" as well.

Boardmember Bethke said that additions more than 45 years are not automatically significant; they need to be significant in their own right.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga could support designation under Criterion C.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports designation under "A" and would support "C"; doesn't feel that changes take away from the architectural style of the home.

Boardmember Silvas has concerns with "A"; it is not the first or even the second development. Report has minimal discussion about the Native American and Mission history in Kensington. Can support "C"; despite changes.

Boardmember Woods agrees with its significant role in the development of Kensington.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – ALBERT EUGENE AND HELEN RILEY HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Motion Passes

(Bethke)

Vote: 7-1-0

Historical Resources Board Minutes of June 24, 2010 Page 6 of 7

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – ALBERT EUGENE AND HELEN RILEY HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURE AND 1926-1935 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE; THE GARAGE CONSTRUCTED IN 1952 IS EXCLUDED FROM THE DESIGNATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone Vote: 3-5-0 Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Woods, Silvas, Bethke, Garbini)

ITEM 8 – WINSLOW R. PARSONS SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Charles Dipietro represented by Johnson & Johnson Architecture

<u>Location</u>: 3520 28th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-D**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3520 28th Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Winslow R. Parsons Spec House #1 located at 3520 28th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion C. The garage constructed in 1965 is excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-10-027

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – 8001 CALLE DE LA PLATA

Applicant: Jacobus and Jill Nooren represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 8001 Calle De La Plata, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 5-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 8001 Calle De La Plata as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the house at 8001 Calle de la Plata as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-10-029

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Marrone agrees that there are lots of stories but it boils down to an urban legend; which tells the story of seven houses built for seven sisters of a developer. CC&R's stated that the homes need to be built in the Spanish or Mediterranean style, whether this is one of the original homes built is not known. This is a modest home/bungalow that has had some modifications; but there are very few like it left. Can it be considered under Criterion A?

Boardmember Silvas compared the story to a creation story about seven sisters who climbed a rope to the sky; irony of association and supports designation under "A".

Vice-Chair Aréchiga supports Staff's recommendation.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of June 24, 2010 Page 7 of 7

Boardmember Curry stated that urban legends are part of cultural history; is home consistent with legend. She is in favor of designation under both Criteria A and C.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini has mixed feelings; the house has its individual characteristics but represents the neighborhood as they are all very similar.

Chair Lemmo stated that there needs to be documentation before association can be made; supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 –8001 CALLE DE LA PLATA UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURE AND 1927 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE

Seconded by Boardmember Curry Vote: 4-4-0 Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Woods, Aréchiga, Bethke)

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, July 22, 2010

LOCATION: City Administration Building

12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:05PM